# **ESG Audit Guide**

Assessing the management of sustainability risks in financial services institutions

Prepared by the Banking Working Groups of the DIIR - Deutsches Institut für Interne Revision e.V.

Status: 8.12.2022



Preamble

The ESG Audit Guide was developed by a group of expert auditors from German banks who are involved in various working groups of the DIIR - Deutsches Institut für Interne Revision e.V. (IIA Germany). Taking up our suggestion to create such a guideline, a group of authors was formed, which put the project into practice with great commitment within a

short period of time. We owe a great debt of gratitude to the authors.

The guideline is the result not only of an analysis of isolated existing regulations and consultations, but also of intensive discussions. This is because the topic of sustainability is a young field of auditing for which ready-made audit catalogues and checklists cannot be found at the present time, but for which - on the contrary - fundamental requirements and benchmarks are only in the process of being developed and are also still subject to major

changes.

The present work has created the basis for approaching the audit object from different directions. The modular structure allows adaptation to the respective circumstances and different focal points. It is becoming very clear that the audit object will expand in the coming years. The Audit Guide will develop accordingly and may become established as a stand-

ard.

On behalf of the Executive Board of DIIR - Deutsches Institut für Interne Revision e.V.

Andrea Bracht

Dr. Stephan Lauer

Member of the DIIR Executive Board

Member of the DIIR Executive Board

2

#### Foreword

The transformation of the economy currently taking place through the shift in the field of sustainability in the areas of environmental, social, and governance (ESG) has far-reaching implications for the financial sector. The financial risk potential, which is inherent in change, is to be identified, assessed, managed, monitored, and made transparent by means of disclosure regulations in accordance with the requirements of German and European supervisory authorities. Among other things, Internal Auditing can create added value in the company through an ex ante-oriented audit and identify implementation risks, deficiencies, and potential for improvement at an early stage.

This DIIR ESG Audit Guide intends to support the internal auditors of financial services institutions designing a structured and target-oriented readiness assessment and evaluating the management of sustainability risks. In line with the modular nature of the audit guide, non-binding questions to guide the audit are presented in the sense of a good practice approach, regardless of whether this is implemented in the form of regular audits, project monitoring or special audits. In this way, modules can be flexibly selected for each type of audit (product, process or governance audit) and for different audit approaches. The categorization of audit questions as **basic questions (B)** and **in-depth questions (D)** intends to take the proportionality principle into account. In principle, the guide can serve as a compendium for all internal audit functions, regardless of the degree of regulation of the organization's operating environment.

The DIIR ESG Audit Guide makes an attempt to map the requirements and expectations of banking supervision with regard to risk management and disclosure and is based in particular on the BaFin bulletin on dealing with sustainability risks (December 20, 2019, last amended on October 1, 2021), the BaFin survey on sustainability risks (October 14, 2021), and the ECB guidance on climate and environmental risks (May 2020).

The DIIR ESG Audit Guide consists of the following chapters

- 1. Responsible corporate governance and strategies,
- 2. Business organization and
- 3. Risk management.

In some cases, there are deliberate redundancies in the individual audit objects n order to enable appropriate partial and cross-sectional audits in different areas.

The authors welcome feedback on the manageability of the audit guide. This is intended to support the ongoing quality assurance and further development of the audit guide in the future. The feedback questions can be found in Section 4 (Appendices) and in an Excel document that is provided along with the audit guide.

In addition, the authors make a proposal for self-assessment with regard to the individual audit fields. This also forms the basis for a planned anonymized DIIR benchmarking between participating organizations. The template for the self-assessment can also be found in the Excel document that is provided along with the audit guide.

### Content

I	Responsible corporate governance and strategies	0
2	Business organization	.11
3	Risk management	.16
4	Attachments	.25
4.1	Feedback questionnaire	.25
4.2	Legal sources	.26
4.3	Definitions	.27

## 1 Responsible corporate governance and strategies

	Audit field and guiding questions	Note	Possible audit procedures
	Corporate Governance		
1 B	Are the roles and responsibilities clearly defined and has there been a clear allocation and division of duties and tasks with regard to strategy responsibility incl. process responsibility among the executive board and management?	BaFin bulletin 4.1, 4.2 ECB Guide, Expectation 3.1	Review of written rules and regulations
2 B	Is there adequate participation and involvement of senior management in the definition and management of sustainability risks?	BaFin Fact Sheet 4.2 ECB Guide, Expectation 3.3	Review of written rules and regulations, minutes of meetings, project control documents
3 B	Are the procedures adequate to ensure that members of management have adequate knowledge and skills to assess sustainability risks?	BaFin Leaflet 4.2 ECB Guideline, Expectation 3.2	Review of rules and regulations, meeting minutes, project control documents, committee training planning
4 B	How does management demonstrate "leading by example" (tone from the top)?  Is there a commitment to sustainability in the bank?	BaFin bulletin 4.4	Review organizational guidelines  Review of in-house announcements, publications, press releases

5 B	How is the successful management of sustainability risks or compli-	BaFin Fact Sheet 4.4	Review organizational guidelines, review as-
	ance with strategic sustainability goals aligned with executive compensation?	ECB Guide, Expectation 4.3	sessment criteria of compensation systems
	Business Strategy		
6 B	How is the handling (measures) of sustainability risks regulated? (Own	BaFin bulletin 3.1.1	Review of strategies (business, risk strategy)
	strategy or as part of an existing strategy)	ECB Guide, Expectation 1.2, 2	Comparison with sustainability report (non-financial reports)
7 D	How is it ensured that different areas of the company are involved as	BaFin bulletin 3.1.1	Review of strategies (business, risk strategy)
	fully as possible in integrating sustainability risks into the business or risk strategy?		Comparison with sustainability report (non-fi- nancial reports)
8 B	Is it regulated in which time frame the implementation of the strategic	BaFin bulletin 3.1.1	Review of strategies (business, risk strategy)
	goals for sustainability risks should take place?		Comparison with sustainability report (non-financial reports)
			Review of project documents

9 B	Does the company follow external sustainability standards or recom-	BaFin bulletin 3.1.2	Review strategies and organizational policies	
	mendations? If yes, is this reflected in the company's own strategies and organizational guidelines and is it sufficiently comprehensible? (Are areas classified as sustainable/non-sustainable?)	Principles for Responsible Banking, Principles for Responsible Investment, Principles for Sustainable Insurance	Analysis of decision protocols	
		Recommendations of the Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosures		
		German Sustainability Code		
		SD-KPI Standard 2016-2021	rd 2016-2021	
		Berlin CSR Consensus on Corporate Responsibility in Supply and Value Chains		
10 B	Which business areas are affected by physical risks and to what ex-	BaFin bulletin 3.2.1	Review of the business segment analyses	
	tent, and what are the (long-term) effects?	ECB Guide, Expectation 1.1, 1.2		
11 B	Which business areas are affected by transitory risks and to what ex-	BaFin bulletin 3.2.2	Review of the business segment analyses	
	tent, and what are the (long-term) effects?	ECB Guide, Expectation 1.1, 1.2		
12 D	How does the company deal with sustainability requirements for third parties (e.g., customers, suppliers, stakeholders)?	BaFin bulletin 3.2.2	Retrace the decision (e.g., committee minutes) as to whether sustainability requirements should be imposed on third parties. Is this documented?	

13 B	How does the company take into account the sustainability awareness of stakeholders or its impact on the (future) business model?	BaFin bulletin 3.2.3	Review of processes for analyzing the business model with regard to the consideration of potential need for change
14 D	Are attempts made to put investment objects or contractual partners on a sustainable course via the exercise of voting rights or dialog with company management or industry representatives?	BaFin bulletin 6.2.6, 6.3.4.1, 6.3.4.2  Exercise of voting rights, especially for KVGs	Review of investment strategy  Review of banking book strategy/treasury strategy
15 B	Has the company decided to offer sustainable products and specified this in the strategies?	BaFin bulletin 3.2.3	Verification of internal/external attestations for products  Review NPP/product catalog
16 B	Is there an impact analysis of sustainability risks on regulatory capital ratios?	BaFin bulletin 3.3.1	Review of the analysis of capital ratios
	Risk Strategy		-
17 B	Does the risk strategy include an analysis of the impact of sustainability risks on risk universe/map/inventory?	BaFin bulletin 3.3.2	Review of the risk strategy with regard to the risk universe
18 B	Has the company defined risk indicators to assess the extent and time horizon of sustainability risks, taking into account risk appetite and risk-bearing capacity?	BaFin bulletin 3.3.2 ECB Guide, Expectation 4.2	Review of risk strategies and organizational policies  Review Risk Appetite Framework, -statement
19 D	Do the risk strategies contain rules on the frequency with which sustainability risks are taken into account in the risk inventory?	BaFin bulletin 3.3.2	Review of risk strategies and organizational policies

20 B	Are comprehensible, appropriate regulations for the measurement and	BaFin bulletin 3.3.3	Review risk strategies and organizational poli-
	management of concentration risks related to sustainability risks provided in the relevant risk strategies?	ECB Guide, Expectation 4.2	cies of the company
21 B	Does the company periodically review its risk strategies for identifying,	BaFin bulletin 3.3.4	Review of risk strategies and organizational
	assessing, managing, monitoring, and reporting physical and transition	ECB Guide, Expectation 7.4	policies of the company
	risks?		Review of risk drivers/concentration risks (countries, sectors, products)
22 B	How does the company ensure that processes for identifying, measur-	BaFin bulletin 3.3.5	Review of the processes for identifying, meas-
22 0	ing, managing, and reporting sustainability risks are improved? (systematically or selectively)	ECB Guide, Expectation 7.4	uring, managing, and reporting sustainability
	Corporate Communications		
23 B	How is the management's defined approach to sustainability risks com-	BaFin bulletin 3.4	Retracing of communication to addressees
	municated? (within management, with employees, contractual partners, investors)		Ü
24 D	Are internal and external publications and pronouncements by mem-	BaFin bulletin 4.4	Review of in-house announcements, publica-
	bers of management consistent with the company's sustainability goals?		tions, press releases
25 B	How has the company decided whether to communicate to stakehold-	BaFin bulletin 3.2.2	Follow-up of decision (e.g., committee minutes)
	ers with significant sustainability risks how such risks can be mitigated or reduced in the future?		whether to enter into a dialogue with third parties
	Have any criteria for excluding or specifically managing certain risk po-	BaFin bulletin 3.4	Follow-up of communication to addressees

## 2 Business organization

	Audit field and audit guiding questions	Note	Possible audit procedures
	Organizational Policies and Processes		
27 B	Are sustainability risks adequately addressed in the relevant organizational policies (risk management, credit, investment, product, other relevant policies) and/or do stand-alone ESG policies exist?	BaFin Leaflet 5.1  ECB Guide, Expectation 3, 3.2, 3.3, 4, 4.1, 7.1, 8.5, 13.1	Analysis of organizational policies  Review of approval procedures, esp. NPP/product catalog.
28 B	Are the responsibilities (division of tasks, competencies) with regard to sustainability risks in the process organization adequately defined in the organizational guidelines? Is there a transparent and documented decision-making process?	BaFin bulletin 5.3 ECB Guide, Expectation 3.1, 5, 5.1, 5.3, 5.4	Analysis of organizational charts  Recording of the decision-making processes
29 D	Does the initial review of transactions with contractual partners or investment objects also include the identification and analysis of sustainability risks and are these included in the decision-making processes?	BaFin bulletin 5.2, 5.6 ECB Guide, Expectation 7.4, 7.5, 8.1	Process recording customer acceptance
30 D	Does the back office monitor the front desk's assessment of sustainability risks and compliance with relevant sustainability-related limits or exclusion criteria? Are limits and exclusion criteria sufficiently and clearly defined?	BaFin bulletin 5.2, 5.7  ECB Guide, Expectation 8.1, 8.3, 8.4	Process recording  Review of limit system

	Resources		
31 B	How does the bank ensure that sufficient and appropriate human and other resources are available to address the new challenges of dealing with sustainability risks?	BaFin bulletin 3.2.4	Review of human resources planning, particularly in the area of risk management, with regard to the impact of sustainability risks
32 B	Have estimates been made for additional staffing requirements, e.g., in risk management?	BaFin bulletin 3.2.4	Review of human resources planning, particularly in the area of risk management, with regard to the impact of sustainability risks
33 B	Do ESG risk training programs exist for employees?	BaFin bulletin 3.2.4	Insight into internal training programs
	Sustainability Unit	-	
34 B	Has an independent sustainability unit (SD) been implemented and what tasks does the SD assume and what risks does it consider?	BaFin bulletin 5.5	Review of organizational charts  Review of committee overviews and rules of procedure  Process recording
35 B	Is the SD appropriately integrated into the relevant existing processes and are the interfaces to other functions adequately defined?	BaFin bulletin 5.5	Review of organizational charts  Review of committee overviews and rules of procedure  Process recording
	Special Functions MaRisk		
36 B	Have measures been taken to strengthen the expertise of the special functions as defined by MaRisk or other units within the institution with regard to sustainability risks?	BaFin bulletin 5.4 ECB Guide, Expectation 5.2	Review planning of training

37 D	Does risk controlling take sustainability risks into account as part of its	BaFin bulletin 5.2, 5.8	Process recording
	activities and is there adequate reporting of significant sustainability risks to management?	ECB Guide, Expectation 6, 6.3	Review Risk Reporting
38 B	Does the compliance function also consider the legal requirements for	BaFin bulletin 5.2, 5.9	Process recording
	the sustainability of companies in the financial sector as part of its activities?	ECB Guide, Expectation 5.5	Review database of supervisory requirements
	Emergency Management		
39 D	Are the main sustainability risks adequately considered in emergency	BaFin bulletin 5.11	Analysis of emergency concept and emergency
	management? Are exit strategies and corresponding processes estab-	ECB Guide, Expectation 9, 9.1	management process
	lished?		Process recording
	Outsourcing Management	-	
40 B	How are sustainability risks taken into account in the case of significant	BaFin bulletin 8.1	Review of outsourcing strategy and policies or
	or critical outsourcing, especially in the case of important or special	BaFin Survey on Sustainability Risks,	guidelines
	functions (control and core banking areas)?	14.10.2021, p. 22	Review of risk analyses
		MaRisk AT 9 para. 4, 5	
		MaGo ch. 13.4	
		§ 36 KAGB	
41 D	To what extent are sustainability risks taken into account in all out-	BaFin Survey on Sustainability Risks,	Review of the methodology and completeness
	sourcing activities?	14.10.2021, p. 23 para. 2	of various registers

42 B	Are responsibilities for sustainability risks in processes for all outsourcing and purchasing processes for other external purchases sufficiently	MaRisk AT 5 para. 3	Review of the specifications in outsourcing and purchasing management
43 B 44 D	Are there standard regulations to be agreed with service providers with regard to sustainability risks?  Are the reporting obligations of service providers sufficiently regulated to most outcome automobility reporting requirements?	BaFin bulletin 8.1  MaRisk AT 9 para. 7  BaFin bulletin 8.1	Review of the contract system and model contracts  Review of the reporting requirements in the out-
45 B	to meet external sustainability reporting requirements?  Are sustainability risks properly included in the risk analysis for identifying material or critical outsourcing and the risks associated with outsourcing?	BaFin bulletin 8.2 ECB Guide, Expectation 9.1	sourcing agreements  Review of the risk analyses in the outsourcing process
46 B	In the case of significant or critical outsourcing, do the outsourcing contracts (if applicable, model contracts) contain appropriate requirements for the service provider to identify, assess, manage, monitor, and report on sustainability risks?	BaFin bulletin 8.3	Review of contracting, model contracts, or out- sourcing agreements on specifications for ser- vice providers to properly incorporate sustaina- bility risks into the service providers' risk management.
47 B	Do the organizational guidelines for central outsourcing management or the outsourcing officer contain appropriate and adequate regulations on processes for dealing with sustainability risks?	BaFin bulletin 8.4	Review of the organizational guideline out- sourcing management
	Group Matters		
48 B	Are there consistent group-wide policies and procedures) in particular on strategies, responsibilities, and risk management with regard to sustainability risks? Are these regulations implemented throughout the Group? Who is in charge for compliance?	BaFin bulletin 9.1	Review of group policies

49 B	Is there a central unit (e.g., sustainability unit) for group-wide sustainability risk management? If so, what are its main tasks?	BaFin bulletin 9.2	Review of organizational charts and organizational guidelines
50 D	How are sustainability concentration risks taken into account in risk management at Group level?	BaFin bulletin 9.3	Evaluation of the group risk strategy and framework
51 B	How is it ensured that sustainability standards, when applied, are observed by all companies in the Group?	BaFin bulletin 9.4	Review of committee documents, group guide- lines, sustainability reporting
52 D	Are sustainability risks taken into account in the risk-bearing capacity calculation at Group level (especially in the economic perspective)?	BaFin bulletin 9.4	Review Risk-bearing capacity calculation group level

## 3 Risk Management

	Audit field and audit guiding questions	Note	Possible audit procedures
	Risk Management Process	•	
53 B	Are the tasks, responsibilities, and timeframe (defined cycle) for identifying, assessing, managing, monitoring, and reporting sustainability risks clearly defined and approved by management?	BaFin bulletin 6.1.1	Review of the sustainability criteria  Review/verification of strategies, policies and procedures in terms of completeness, timeliness and consistency of definition, responsibilities.
54 B	Are the methods and procedures for assessing, managing, monitoring, and reporting sustainability risks reviewed at regular intervals (in the sense of an adequacy check)?  Does this include the quality of the underlying data?	BaFin bulletin 6.1.2	Review risk inventory, esp. for central vs. decentralized responsibilities

55 B	Are (physical and transitory) sustainability risks along with their impact on the effects on the well-known risk types (counterparty default risks, market price risks, etc.) considered in written risk management regulations? How are ESG risks transferred to the main risk types? Are sustainability risks that have a significant impact on the asset, income, and liquidity situation integrated into the existing risk measurement procedures?	BaFin bulletin 6.1.3, 2.7, 6.6.1	Review of risk inventory in terms of timeliness and completeness  Review of the procedures for identifying new sustainability risks or changes resulting from them for the risk management process  Review of the reporting
56 D	Do suitable processes exist for the early identification of sustainability risks?  Do procedures exist to avoid or reduce sustainability risks (e.g., avoidance of reputational damage)?	BaFin bulletin 6.1.3	Process recording  Attention to interfaces with other audits, e.g. complaint management, but also lending business (loan defaults in connection with environmental disasters), treasury (price changes), deposit business (customers' investment wishes)
57 B	Are escalation processes defined for involving the management level in dealing with sustainability risks?  Are existing escalation processes used or supplemented to involve the management level in dealing with sustainability risks?	BaFin bulletin 6.1.4	Process recording  Examination of escalation procedures (ad-hoc procedures as well as regular procedures)  Review of the reporting  Processes for handling complaints/incidents related to sustainability

58 D	Are appropriate risk indicators defined to assess the extent and time horizon for sustainability risks in the risk-bearing capacity and risk appoints?	BaFin bulletin 6.1.5	Reconciliation of strategies, risk inventory and their results with current KPIs
	petite?		Fit of KPIs with business areas/risks
	Can sustainability risks that are recorded under strategic, operational, or reputational risks also be quantified, in other words, what is the procedure for qualitative assessment?		Evaluation of complaints/incidents
59 D	Are sustainability risks taken into account in loan processing (loan granting and loan follow-up)?	BaFin bulletin 6.6.3	Process recording Credit processes
			Note: Corresponding issues also arise for deposit business (customers), own investments/investment book
60 D	Does the credit check identify and assess future risks, such as sustainability risks, in a complete, risk-oriented and appropriate manner (taking scenarios into account, if necessary) and, if applicable, verify them through independent sources?	BaFin bulletin 6.6.3	Process recording credit processes
61 D	Are internal bank findings and information taken into account in external credit checks?	BaFin bulletin 6.6.3	Process recording credit processes
62 D	Are sustainability risks (e.g., energy efficiency of real estate, flood events) also taken into account in the context of collateral valuations?	BaFin bulletin 6.6.4	Process recording credit processes , here: collateral processes

63 D	Are internal and also external sources used to identify sustainability risks?	BaFin Fact Sheet 4.3	Review of data flow diagrams
	Is data required for the risk management of sustainability risks held in		Alignment with data governance and data quality guidelines
	accordance with BCBS 239?		Verification of certification from external sources
			Review of service level agreements
64 B	Are sustainability risks adequately addressed in internal reporting?	BaFin bulletin 6.5	Review risk reporting
	Are quantitative vs. qualitative impacts sufficiently acknowledged?		
65 D	Are the special characteristics of sustainability risks (time horizon, in-	BaFin bulletin 6.5, 7.6	Review risk reporting
	teraction with other risks) adequately taken into account in the report- ing? Qualitative or descriptive statements based on scenario analyses can also be formulated for this purpose.		Comparison with scenario analyses
	Risk Management Methodology	-	
66 B	Are there methods for managing and/or limiting sustainability risks that are consistent with the business and risk strategy?	BaFin bulletin 6.2	Alignment of control methods with business and risk strategy
			Review of risk inventory
67 B	Are exclusion criteria/limits defined for this purpose? For example, are certain customer transactions or sectors not carried out or only carried	BaFin bulletin 6.2	Alignment of control methods with business and risk strategy
	out to a limited extent?		Review of risk inventory
			Keyword: clear and transparent communication regarding business activities

68 D	Alternatively, are appropriate positive lists drawn up (focus on specific	BaFin bulletin 6.2.2, 6.2.3	Review of the positive lists
	companies, sectors, etc.)? Alternatively, are the companies in an in- dustry selected that best meet the sustainability criteria (best-in-class approach)?		Reconciliation with revenue strategy, as use
			may have an impact on the revenue situation
			because it is not flexible enough
	Is the use of positive lists appropriately differentiated in order to avoid greenwashing, among other things?		Review of the validation of positive lists (e.g.,
			when using indices)
			Critical appraisal of the appropriateness of the
			procedure (if necessary, negative approach
			more suitable)
69 D	Was the determination of the above limits/positive lists also based on internationally recognized standards?	BaFin bulletin 6.2.4	Comparison of the definition procedures with
			relevant standards (e.g., UN-Goals, EU-Taxon-
			omy)
70 B	Are risk analysis or classification procedures used to identify and assess sustainability risks, and is integration properly implemented?		Review of procedural documentation
			Review of process changes (e.g., change re-
			quests)
			Review of system audits
			Review NPP process
71 B	Is the risk analysis or a risk classification procedure used to comply with legal and internal company requirements (e.g., limits/exclusion criteria)?	BaFin bulletin 6.3.1	Comparison with limit systems, exclusion crite-
			ria
			Review of the business strategy
			Inspection of controlling data (scope of busi-
			ness)

72 B	Are risk mitigation or risk avoidance measures defined depending on the risk assessment of the contractual partner/investment object?	BaFin bulletin 6.3.1	Reconciliation with customer classification procedures/investment approval documentation.
			Audit credit/collateral processes
73 D	Are business contract partners examined with regard to their affiliation	BaFin bulletin 6.3.2	Review customer onboarding checklist
	with an emissions-intensive industry (incl. upstream and downstream supply chains)? An individual examination of the risk position should		Sample customer file
	be carried out (external suppliers on the basis of a heat map are only indications).		Alignment with outsourcing process and operational functional areas
74 D	For higher risk transactions (e.g., indications of heat map sustainability	BaFin bulletin 6.3.3	Review customer onboarding checklist
	risk), are more intensive analyses of the business model performed (e.g., to determine transition risk)?		Sample customer file
75 D	Are appropriate measures to reduce the contractor's sustainability risk agreed and implemented?	BaFin bulletin 6.3.4.3, 6.3.4.4	Process recording
	How are these measures defined (action plan incl. schedule and reporting requirements)?		Sample customer file
	Is there reasonable tracking within the bank?		
	How are appropriate escalation processes defined in the event of non-compliance?		
76 D	Are sustainability risks adequately taken into account in the design of the terms and conditions?	BaFin bulletin 6.3.5	Review contract conditions

77 B	Are sustainability risk limits used to make transaction decisions?	BaFin bulletin 6.3.4.6	Review of external appraisals, due diligence,
	Do limit overruns lead to the rejection of transactions or is an escalation process initiated?		credit decision submissions.  Audit own investments/treasury
78 B	Are sustainability risks considered completely, institution-specifically, and appropriately in the risk inventory or portfolio analysis?	BaFin bulletin 6.4	Review of risk inventory, portfolio analysis
79 B	Is the risk-bearing capacity also given in consideration of sustainability risks (incl. risk concentrations)?	BaFin bulletin 6.6.2	Review of risk-bearing capacity calculation, risk inventory
			Review of committee decisions
	Stress Test/Scenario Analyses	<u> </u>	
80 B	Do existing bank-specific stress tests adequately reflect sustainability	BaFin bulletin 7.1	Review stress testing framework
	risks? Are these taken into account in the stress testing framework?		Review scenario documentation

81 D	Are scenarios used that adequately and fully take into account physical as well as transitory risks and allow a statement on the resilience of the institution?  Do the stress tests take into account scenario analyses that are plausible and sufficiently long-term? Are these regularly scrutinized and adjusted?	BaFin bulletin 7.2	Review scenario documentation with a focus on transitory risks (e.g., how will the promotion of electric cars be assessed in 10 years? What will the impact be 10 years from now due to what is perceived to be an environmentally friendly design today?)
	justeu :		Plausibility check of the time horizon of the sce- narios against the background of transitory risks
			Plausibility check of the scenarios with regard to physical risks
			Plausibility check regarding adverse scenarios
82 D	When using Integrated Assessment Modeling (IAM) for transition scenarios, are scenario analysis methods critically appreciated?	BaFin bulletin 7.3	Review of specialist concepts evaluation models
83 D	Are realistic impact scenarios for physical risks created and modelled, covering a long-term time horizon?	BaFin bulletin 7.4	Review scenario documentation
84 D	Are several alternative scenarios, based on different combinations of assumptions, considered? Do these fit the bank's business model and risk profile?	BaFin bulletin 7.5	Review scenario documentation

	ESG Rating	-	
85 D	Are ESG factors only taken into account in the credit rating if they have	BaFin bulletin 10.1	Process recording credit rating (process min-
	an influence on the creditworthiness of a company or the credit risk of a financial instrument?	ECB Guideline para. 6.2	ing)
		EBA GL LOM para. 126, 146	
86 D	Are the ESG ratings used clearly distinguishable from the credit ratings	BaFin bulletin 10.2	Process recording credit rating (target/actual
	used?	ECB Guideline para. 6.2	comparison)
		EBA GL LOM para. 126, 146	
87 D	Are there uniform standards for the ESG ratings used or do they com-	BaFin bulletin 10.3	Comparison of ESG rating concept with, e.g.,
	ply with the EU taxonomy?	ECB Guide para. 6.2	EU taxonomy
		EBA GL LOM para. 126, 146	Critical appraisal of ESG data providers (certifications, etc.)
88 D	Have ESG ratings used been sufficiently validated with regard to the	BaFin bulletin 10.4	Sample credit
	sustainability of a financial investment and have aspects of sustainability been distinguished from those of creditworthiness or credit risk as	ECB Guide para. 6.2	
	part of the validation process if these are unrelated?	EBA GL LOM para. 126, 146	

#### 4 Attachments

#### 4.1 Feedback questionnaire

Thank you very much! DIIR would like to thank you for taking the time to evaluate the DIIR ESG Audit Guide and thereby contributing to the improvement of the guide by sharing your opinion! We look forward to your user experiences and opinions!

You can easily copy the following feedback questions into an email to arbeitskreise@diir.de and send us your answers:

- 1. Overall, how helpful did you find the audit guide for your (a) initial audit or (b) follow-up audit?
- 2. Was the initial effort for an ESG audit lower with the use of the DIIR ESG Audit Guide than without its use?
- 3. How would you rate the complexity of the exam or the level of difficulty?
- 4. How did you find the handling of the audit guide and its structure?
- 5. How do you assess the applicability/relevance for your company?
- 6. Were the sources or further information possibilities apparent to you?
- 7. In your opinion, are there any questions or issues that are (a) not sufficiently presented/checked or (b) missing?
- 8. Is there anything else you would like to tell us or bring to our attention?
- 9. Was the "B" or "D" indicator helpful in your assessment of the audit fields, did you omit it from your audit, or are there any comments you would like to make about it?

#### 4.2 Legal sources

German Federal Financial Supervisory Authority (BaFin): Merkblatt zum Umgang mit Nachhaltigkeitsrisiken, 1.10.2021, https://www.bafin.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/Merkblatt/dl\_mb\_Nachhaltigkeitsrisiken.pdf?\_\_blob=publicationFile&v=9 (as of 7.4.2022).

German Federal Financial Supervisory Authority (BaFin): Circular 10/2021 (BA) - Minimum Requirements for Risk Management (MaRisk), August 16, 202, https://www.bafin.de/SharedDocs/Veroeffentlichungen/DE/Rund-schreiben/2021/rs\_1021\_MaRisk\_BA.html (as of April 7, 2022).

German Federal Financial Supervisory Authority (BaFin): Sachstandserhebung Nachhaltigkeitsrisiken, 14.10.2021, https://www.bafin.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/Aufsichtsrecht/dl\_Bericht\_Umfrage\_Sustainable\_Finance.html (as of 7.4.2022).

European Central Bank (ECB): Guidance on Climate and Environmental Risks, November 2020, https://www.bankingsupervision.europa.eu/ecb/pub/pdf/ssm.202011finalguideonclimate-relatedandenvironmentalrisks~58213f6564.en.pdf (as of 7.4.2022).

European Banking Authority (EBA): Guidelines on Lending and Supervision, EBA/GL/2020/06, May 29, 2020, https://www.eba.europa.eu/sites/default/documents/files/document\_library/Publications/Guidelines/2020/Guidelines%20on%20loan%20origination%20and%20monitoring/Translations/886677/Final%20Report%20on%20GL%20on%20loan%20origination%20and%20monitoring\_COR\_DE.pdf (as of April 7, 2022).

Financial Stability Board (FSB): Recommendations of the Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosures, June 2017, https://assets.bbhub.io/company/sites/60/2021/10/FI-NAL-2017-TCFD-Report.pdf (as of 7.4.2022).

National CSR Forum of the German Federal Government: Berlin CSR Consensus on Corporate Responsibility in Supply and Value Chains, June 25, 2018, https://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/Arbeitsrecht/csr-konsens-lieferwertschoepfungsketten.html (as of April 7, 2022).

German Council for Sustainable Development (RNE): The German Sustainability Code (DNK), https://www.deutscher-nachhaltigkeitskodex.de/ (as of 7.4.2022).

UN Environment Program: Principles for Responsible Banking, https://www.unepfi.org/banking/bankingprinciples/ (as of 7.4.2022).

UN Environment Program: Principles for Responsible Investment, https://www.un-pri.org/about-us/about-the-pri (as of 7.4.2022).

UN Environment Program: Principles for Sustainable Insurance, <a href="https://www.unepfi.org/psi/">https://www.unepfi.org/psi/</a> (as of 7.4.2022).

#### 4.3 Definitions

Sustainability risks

ESG Environmental Social Governance (Environment, Social and Cor-

porate Governance)

United Nations Sustainable 17 United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)<sup>1</sup>

Development Goals

Sustainability risks within the meaning of thefactsheet are events or conditions from the ESG (environmental, social or corporate governance) areas, the occurrence of which may actually or potentially have a significant negative impact on the net assets, financial position, and results of operations as well as on the reputation of a company; this includes climate-related risks in the form of *physical risks* and *transition risks*. <sup>2</sup>

BaFin sees sustainability risks as a partial aspect of the known risk types<sup>3</sup> - see MaRisk:<sup>4</sup> Credit risk/counterparty risk see BTO 1 Lending business' BTR 1 Counterparty risks, Market price risk see BTR 2 Market price risks, Liquidity risk see BTR 3 Liquidity risks, Operational risk see BTR 4 Operational risks

Physical risks results from both individual extreme weather events and their consequences (examples: Heat and drought periods, flooding, storms, hail, forest fires, avalanches) as well as long-term changes in climatic and ecological conditions (examples: Precipitation frequency and amounts, weather instability, sea level rise, changes in ocean and air currents, ocean acidification, increases in average temperatures with regional extremes).

Physical risks

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://unric.org/de/17ziele/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> BaFin: Leaflet on dealing with sustainability risks (consultation version 20.09.2019), p.14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> BaFin: Leaflet on dealing with sustainability risks (consultation version 20.09.2019), p.14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> BaFin: Circular 10/2021 (BA), Minimum Requirements for Risk Management (MaRisk).

Physical risks can also have indirect consequences (examples: Collapse of supply chains, abandonment of water-intensive business activities to climate-induced migration and armed conflicts).<sup>5</sup>

Transition risks

Transition risks exist in connection with the transition to a low-carbon economy: Political measures can lead to an increase in the price and/or shortage of fossil fuels (examples: coal phase-out, CO<sub>2</sub> tax) or to high investment costs due to the necessary renovation of buildings and plants. New technologies can displace familiar ones (example: electromobility), and changing customer preferences and societal expectations can endanger companies that have not adapted.<sup>6</sup>

Interdependencies

There are interdependencies between physical risks and transition risks. A sharp increase in physical risks would require a more abrupt change in the economy, which in turn leads to higher transition risks.<sup>7</sup>

Risk concentrations

In addition to risk positions (see sustainability risks) vis-à-vis individual counterparties that represent a risk concentration due to their size alone, risk concentrations can arise both from the synchronization of risk positions within a risk type (intra-risk concentrations) and from the synchronization of risk positions across different risk types (due to common risk factors or due to interactions of different risk factors of different risk types, interrisk concentrations).<sup>8</sup>

Greenwashing

Sale of supposedly sustainable financial products<sup>9</sup>

Sustainable (financial) products

E.g., green bonds, social bonds, green loans, sustainable investment assets

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> BaFin: Leaflet on dealing with sustainability risks (consultation version 20.09.2019), p.11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> BaFin: Leaflet on dealing with sustainability risks (consultation version 20.09.2019), p.11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> BaFin: Leaflet on dealing with sustainability risks (consultation version 20.09.2019), p.10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> BaFin: Minimum Requirements for Risk Management (MaRisk), Explanatory Notes on Circular 10/2021 (BA) (August 16, 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> BaFin: Leaflet on dealing with sustainability risks (consultation version 20.09.2019), p.14.

#### Authors

This guideline was developed by the banking working groups of DIIR – Deutsches Institut für Interne Revision e.V.

Name	Institute
Matthias Frank Baumann	KfW
Stephan Bellarz	DZ BANK
Sebastian Franke	Deutsche Apotheker- und Ärztebank
Sebastian Huth	Landesbank Hesse-Thuringia
Tim Hustermeier	UBS Europe
Alexandra Kaltenbach	DekaBank
Alegra Konitzer	Berlin Savings Bank
Chris Mudrack	DKB Deutsche Kreditbank
Anna Reich (Management)	Helaba Landesbank Hessen-Thüringen
Carsten Rilinger	LBBW Landesbank Baden-Württemberg
Jens Roehr	Commerzbank
Mechthilde Roesch	B. Metzler seel. Son & Co.
Jill Round	KfW
Dominik Schäfer	German Bank
Sebastian Schaube	Taunus Savings Bank
Carsten Wulle	Helaba Landesbank Hessen-Thüringen

Published April 14<sup>th</sup>, 2022 at www.diir.de. Translation into English published December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2022.

DIIR – Deutsches Institut für Interne Revision e.V. (IIA Germany) Theodor-Heuss-Allee 108 60486 Frankfurt am Main